Introduction

Férdia J. Stone-Davis

To transcend is to go beyond. Understood as such, the term has a wide application to a variety of phenomena and across a range of disciplines. However, within the domains of theology and philosophy (and discussions between the two) the idea of transcendence has acquired particular relevance. Here, two understandings tend to prevail: transcendence is either conceived in vertical terms, situated in relation to an 'absolute' that lies *beyond* the material, or it is unpacked in horizontal terms, remaining situated *within* the 'immanent', within the material realm and its evanescence.¹

The conceptual separation of these two understandings has been located in a historical shift that sees a move away from a worldview that is anchored metaphysically and is vertically oriented (one often termed pre-modern) towards one that is grounded in and arises from the world and is horizontally oriented (one frequently associated with the modern).² Within the vertical, or absolute, worldview, the cosmos and everything contained within it is given and ordered by an ultimate, external and otherworldy source: knowledge is bound up with the discovery of a certain contiguity between this absolute and its immanent manifestation. Hence the importance of the *quadrivium* (arithmetic, music, geometry and astronomy) within the classical education system, and Anicius

Mark Johnson conceptualises the vertical and horizontal forms of transcendence thus: vertical transcendence is the 'alleged capacity to rise above and shed our finite human form and to "plug into the infinite". Horizontal transcendence 'recognises the inescapability of human finitude and is compatible with the embodiment of meaning, mind, and personal identity. From this human perspective, transcendence consists in our happy ability to sometimes "go beyond" our present situation in transformative acts that change both our world and ourselves' (*The Meaning of the Body: Aesthetics of Human Understanding* (Chicago, 2007), p. 281).

² Charles Taylor sees this move from vertical or transcendent world structures to those that are horizontal and closed as constitutive of modernity ('Closed World Structures', in Mark A. Wrathall (ed.), *Religion after Metaphysics* (Cambridge, 2003), pp. 47–68). This is worked out more substantially in Charles Taylor, *A Secular Age* (Cambridge, Mass. and London, 2007). For an overview of some of the features contributing to a disappearance of the 'transcendentally oriented cosmic vision', see Ferdia J. Stone-Davis, *Musical Beauty: Negotiating the Boundary between Subject and Object* (Eugene, Oreg., 2011), pp. 179–82 (p. 181).

© Copyrighted Material

Boethius's claim that arithmetic is the most significant amongst its disciplines due to its reliance upon number:³

From the beginning, all things whatever which have been created may be seen by the nature of things to be formed by reason of numbers. Number was the principal exemplar in the mind of the creator. From it were derived the multiplicity of the four elements, from it were derived the changes of the seasons, from it the movement of the stars and the turning of the heavens.⁴

Within the horizontal, or immanent, worldview, the cosmic whole and its ultimate foundation no longer stand in view, and the locus of knowledge shifts to the subject. Immanuel Kant is indicative of such a move to the immanent realm, since within his account (theoretical) reason cannot attain absolute and unconditional knowledge but encounters boundaries beyond which it cannot proceed without contradiction. In its legitimate use it leads to knowledge but only when circumscribed by the constraint of 'possible experience'. When used to transcend experience, reason leads into a realm of illusion. Kant therefore proposes a 'Copernican revolution' for philosophy:

Previously it has been assumed that *all of our cognition must conform itself to objects*; but under this assumption all attempts to decide something about objects *a priori* through concepts, and by which our cognition would be extended, have come to nothing. Let us now, therefore, test whether we do not make better progress on the problems of metaphysics by assuming that *objects must conform themselves to our cognition.*⁵

In the process of this historical and conceptual shift from absolute to immanent transcendence, a set of dualisms is put in place, opposing universal and particular, eternal and temporal, immaterial and material. Moreover, the two planes of

³ Boethius was concerned to transmit ancient Greek knowledge to the Latin-speaking world. He is said to have coined the term *quadrivium* and whilst there were two extant orderings of its disciplines (one by Boethius, the other by Martianus Capella), it was the Boethian one that was studied in schools and universities throughout the Middle Ages (see Stone-Davis, *Musical Beauty*, pp. 2–3).

⁴ Anicius Boethius, *De Institutione Musica* [Fundamentals of Music], 1.2, trans. C.M. Bower, ed. C.V. Palisca (New Haven, Conn., 1989).

Immanuel Kant, Critique of Pure Reason, Preface to the Second Edition, b xvi, in Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics that will be able to Come Forward as Science with Selections from the Critique of Pure Reason, trans. and ed. Gary Hatfield, revd edn (Cambridge, 2004): italics added. Kant continues: 'Matters stand here just as they did for the first thoughts of Copernicus, who, when things did not go well for explaining the celestial motions if he assumed that the entire host of stars rotates about the observer, sought to find whether things might not go better if he had the observer rotate, and by contrast left the stars at rest' (ibid., xvii).

© Copyrighted Materia

transcendence are very often disconnected, such that either one plane is reduced to the other, or transcendence is altogether negated. Such an oppositional logic is not the only option however. It is in recognition of this that Calvin Schrag posits the term 'transversality' in relation to religion. According to Schrag, transversality acknowledges the formative role of the vertical and horizontal conceptions of transcendence whilst pressing forward non-dualistically, splitting the difference between 'the metaphysical postulates of vertically elevated transcendence and horizontally demarcated immanence'. 8 How so? Alterity, a sense of 'otherness', is integral to the idea of transcendence, since in going beyond I am brought into contact with that which is 'other'. This otherness is conceived differently in conceptions of absolute and immanent transcendence. In the former, according to Schrag, alterity is 'vertically super-imposed, hierarchically over-arching, hegemonic and heteronomous'. 9 This framework is reflected in Boethius's writings. This contrasts with the latter, where alterity is fleeting, resulting from a random juxtaposition and serial succession on a horizontal plane of pure immanence'. 10 Thus, for Deleuze, whom Schrag draws attention to, immanence 'is not in something, to something; it does not depend on an object or belong to a subject³. 11 Rather, absolute immanence

As an example of the reduction of horizontal to vertical transcendence, Schrag directs attention to Emmanuel Levinas, who posits the 'preeminence of transcendence over immanence' (Calvin O. Schrag, 'Transcendence and Transversality', in John D. Caputo and Michael J. Scanlon (eds), Transcendence and Beyond: A Postmodern Enquiry (Bloomington and Indianapolis, 2007), pp. 204-18 (p. 208)). This understanding is supported by Caputo and Scanlon who cast Levinas's work as an articulation of 'hypertranscendence', that is, 'an even more transcendent transcendence' (John D. Caputo and Michael J. Scanlon, 'Introduction: Do We Need to Transcend Transcendence?', in Caputo and Scanlon (eds), Transcendence and Beyond, pp. 1-14 (p. 2)). Illustrating the converse, Schrag cites Gilles Deleuze's espousal of 'pure immanence' ('Transcendence and Transversality', p. 207). Caputo and Scanlon select Gianni Vattimo as indicative of the move towards 'post-transcendence', where transcendence is accomplished 'within the horizon of the world' ('Introduction', p. 4). More recently, Mark Johnston provides noteworthy attempts to re-conceptualise issues formerly associated with 'absolute' transcendence within a naturalised (that is, 'immanent') frame (see Saving God: Religion after Idolatry (Princeton, NJ, 2009); Surviving Death (Princeton, NJ, 2010)).

⁷ Extreme forms of the immanent tendency are tangible within some circles of contemporary thought, especially in recent forms of rational fundamentalism, including 'scientism' (see Richard Dawkins, *The God Delusion* (London, 2006); for a response to Dawkins, see Alister McGrath, *The Dawkins Delusion? Atheist Fundamentalism and the Denial of the Divine* (London, 2007)). For an outline of scientism in relation to the non-existence of 'self', as well as a refutation of this position, see Mary Midgley, *Are You an Illusion* (Durham, 2014).

⁸ Schrag, 'Transcendence and Transversality', p. 211.

[🏂] Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid.

Gilles Deleuze, *Pure Immanence: Essays on A Life*, trans. A. Boyman (New York, 2001), p. 26. Deleuze continues: 'immanence is not related to Some Thing as a unity

[©] Copyrighted Material

is 'a life', a series of 'singularities' and 'events' that unfolds, is never complete and is constantly becoming other.¹²

Transversality is neither entirely absolute nor wholly immanent. It is 'a convergence without coincidence, a congruence without identity, an interaction without assimilation'. Giving an example of how transcendence conceived transversally might work in the sphere of religion, Schrag turns to the command to love one's neighbour as oneself. Use hove, he maintains, exhibits a transversal dynamic: it exhibits an alterity that is 'always other and prior to our discourse and action', is since it is 'truly a love that exceeds and surpasses, transcendence in a quite robust sense, an *other* that is truly other than all the others within the circulation of distribution and exchange that stimulates the economies of the mundane culture-spheres'. Within this context, and conceived as transversal, love interrupts the vertical-horizontal axis: its invocation allows elements to interconnect on the horizontal plane in relation to a source that lies beyond and issues a call to them.

If the vertical and horizontal senses of transcendence have developed particularly in relation to theology and philosophy, why a collection on music and transcendence? Moreover, how is a transversally conceived transcendence to be situated in relation to music? Two answers present themselves immediately. First, music is enmeshed in the historical and conceptual shift outlined above and the conceptions of absolute and immanent transcendence, both in terms of its practice and the ways in which it is theorised. Thus, in broad terms, the spatial translation from absolute to immanent marks a shift away from understanding music as part of the fabric of the cosmos towards understanding it in relation to the material realm conceived immanently. It also involves a re-conception of the connection between music, self-understanding and self-expression. Second, although music has become entangled with the dualisms accompanying the dichotomisation of the absolute and the immanent, it pursues a course that is transversal, since it unsettles any simple divisions. The music event¹⁷ relies upon

superior to all things or to a Subject as an act that brings about a synthesis of things' (ibid., p. 27; quoted in Schrag, Transcendence and Transverality', p. 207).

^{&#}x27;A life has quite different features than those Locke associated with the self – consciousness, memory, and personal identity. It unfolds according to another logic: a logic of impersonal individuation rather than personal individualisation, of singularities rather than particularities. It can never be completely specified. It is always indefinite – a life' (John Rajchman, 'Introduction', in Deleuze, *Pure Immanence*, pp. 7–23 (p. 8)).

Schrag, 'Transcendence and Transversality', p. 217.

¹⁴ Ibid., p. 216.

¹⁵ Ibid., p. 217.

¹⁶ Ibid., pp. 216–17.

Elsewhere, I elaborate my preference for speaking of the music event, since it recognises that music is not a singular entity but a temporally performed practice that is manifold in occurrence and in each instantiation performs its own logic, its own way of contemplating (see Férdia J. Stone-Davis, 'Music and Liminality: Becoming Sensitized',

the destabilisation of inside and outside, involving the commingling of sound and the human body. Not only is the aural threshold easily trespassed, so is that of the entire body, which internalises external sounds:

The human experience of sound involves, in addition to the sympathetic vibration of the ear-drums, the sympathetic vibration of the resonators of the body. Sound, shaped and resonating with the properties of the internal and external configurations, textures and movements of the objects of the external world, can thus be felt in addition to being heard. 18

The music event is also simultaneously universal and particular (in some sense eternal and temporal), since it occurs in time but has its own time. Indeed, appearing at different points in time, musical iterations can be homologous and yet distinct. Moreover, the music event is immaterial and material: it is produced through physical means and yet when heard as music is not simply an event in physical space. It is a movement within a space of its own.

This transversal dynamic is further exemplified within the music event by virtue of the dynamic of call and response which it exhibits. Although performed, music is not reducible to the physical actions that give rise to it. In fact, music issues its own call to and exerts its own demand on those who experience it, since the sounds produced exhibit a resistance to the gestures that give rise to them and this resistance shapes subsequent actions. Thus, although 'lengths of channels of air and pieces of string are altered through the impression of the human body', the interaction is not one-way, since 'the sound yielded in turn has an impact on the player, who responds to it'. 19 It is on this basis that the musician's practice session functions and that musical contours emerge. This call and response extends further: music always eschews singular ascriptions of meaning, remaining at all times polysemic. It resists unidirectional cause-andeffect models of communication and instead evokes a variety of responses. In this way, music is not dissimilar from love. Music issues a call to which responses are made, forming a point of orientation and offering interconnection on the horizontal plane whilst remaining resistant to appropriation (the requisition of music is never wholly successful).²⁰ Music remains beyond the circulation of distribution and exchange through the strength of its alterity.

in Birgit Abels (ed.), Embracing Restlessness: Cultural Musicology (Hildesheim, forthcoming)).

John Shepherd and Peter Wicke, *Music and Cultural Theory* (Cambridge, 1997), p. 1270

¹⁹⁰ Stone-Davis, Musical Beauty, p. 162.

For specific examples of how this so, see M.J. Grant and Férdia J. Stone-Davis (eds), *The Soundtrack of Conflict: The Role of Radio Broadcasting in Wartime and Conflict Situations* (Hildesheim, 2013).

[©] Copyrighted Material

In sum, music is not only bound up with the notions of absolute and immanent transcendence as they have developed both historically and conceptually; but, by virtue of its mode of being, which enacts a transversal dynamic and remains poised between the two, is able to elucidate the limitations of such a development and its accompanying dualisms. This makes sense in (at least) two ways: (1) if transcendence refers to going beyond, then it is unreasonable to delimit a priori how, in what way and to what extent it does so; (2) acknowledging the limitations of the division between absolute and immanent transcendence and the advantages of a transversal conception (which remains open to the two) facilitates discussions about the notion of transcendence across disciplines. As Schrag notes in relation to rationality: 'one can give reasons for the truth of propositions, right actions, and good art without having the criteria of judgement in each of the spheres becoming coincident with one to the other'. Thus, one can embrace the fact, as Albrecht Wellmer suggests elsewhere, that different 'language games' correspond to 'different perspectives from which we "look at" empirical reality'. 22

Drawing upon a one-day international interdisciplinary conference held at the Cambridge Union with the support of Anglia Ruskin University and the British Society of Aesthetics, this collection offers musicological, theological and philosophical explorations of music and transcendence. The organisation of the volume enacts in some measure the issues central to the discussion above and the importance of music. The contributions are gathered into two sections: 'Music and Absolute Transcendence' and 'Music and Immanent Transcendence'. Each section begins with contributions that take specific musical instances as their focus (pieces, practices, figures and events) and moves towards contributions that have theoretical issues as their main concern. As will become clear, the notion of transcendence is built into the structure of music through its refusal of oppositions. It is here, through its transversal dynamic, that meaning accrues. Thus, although contributions are situated primarily in relation to either the notion of absolute or the notion of immanent transcendence, they very often gesture outwards to, and very often integrate aspects of, the other.

Music and Absolute Transcendence

Beginning the section 'Music and Absolute Transcendence', Christopher Page elucidates how the development and practice of Gregorian chant, which arises within the pre-modern worldview, is bound up with absolute transcendence. Most markedly, chant interlaces with events that mark the punctuation of the natural by the supernatural, acting transformatively in the process. Importantly,

²¹ Calvin O. Schrag, *God as Otherwise than Being: Towards a Semantics of the Gift* (Evanston, Ill., 2002), p. 41.

Albrecht Wellmer, 'On Spirit as Part of Nature', *Constellations*, 16/2 (2009): 213–26 (p. 217).

[©] Copyrighted Material

however, such events are embedded within and facilitated by more earthly modes of transcendence: music's capacity to include and exclude, to consolidate and separate, draws together the bodies and minds of those of holy orders who sing the chants. Through the evolution of liturgical repertory, music and text create a sense of Christian identity that traverses Europe but not in a way that eradicates difference. On the contrary, local identities are reinforced and rendered meaningful through the difference of individual chants from the 'norm' provided by repertory. Another earthly and wholly practical development is notation. Although it, in a certain sense, renders the intangibility of music tangible by capturing and fixing it in visible form, it does so in order that clergy might increase the hours they dedicate to pious works, thereby transcending the desires of the body. Thus, the universality granted by earthly, immanent developments in the dissemination of Frankish-Roman chant allows a vertical, absolute extension: heaven and earth become intimately associated such that the contingent is held within the embrace of eternity.

The intermingling of the absolute and the immanent finds different articulation in Sukanya Sarbadhikary's contribution, which focuses on accounts of participants and musicians involved in *kirtan*. Exploring its phenomenology, Sarbadhikary shows how this devotional practice of the Bengal Vaishnavas prompts a 'sonic sensuality' that at once manifests the erotic interplay between the Hindu deity consort Radha-Krishna whilst enveloping participants within the transcendental place in which it occurs. The bodies of participants as well as the bodies of instruments are integral to this process: the repetitive and heightening chant that participants aspirate invoke the erotics of Krishna and Radha, as do the acoustics of the instruments, rendering their bodies and sounds sacred, and drawing them into close proximity with the bodies of the musicians who play them. The desire for corporeal oneness is invoked at every level of *kirtan*, entwining those involved with the pastimes of Radha-Krishna.

Exploring the traces that remain of a cosmic perspective of music within a modern purview, John Habron considers the thought and compositional practice of Ferruccio Busoni and the importance of the 'realm of music', which stands beyond time and space, framing earthly instances of music. Here, dualities are held in tension such that past and present are contained within an eternal flux, and all manner of melodies and tonalities co-exist. These provide the material for music composition and performance, and Habron shows how Busoni attempts not only to explore the implications of the other-worldly character of music within his compositional practice but also strives to retain something of this even whilst bounding it within particular instances.

Bruce Ellis Benson shows how transcendence, conceived in absolute terms, manifests in conceptions of artistic practice, demonstrating how the notion of divine *creatio ex nihilo* and the concomitant notions of absolute power and freedom which ensure God's otherness, are mirrored in conceptions of the artist that emphasise genius. The artistic genius is innovative, working inexplicably and producing results that are exemplary in character. Benson makes a case for

considering both divine and artistic creation as improvisatory, structured by a 'call' that always precedes the 'response' that follows. The response is never a solitary one but emerges from and on behalf of others, so that notions of quotation and originality, old and new, and even you and me, unravel.

If Habron's and Benson's contributions show how a top-down way of thinking about transcendence finds articulation in understandings of music, Russell Re Manning and Roger Scruton are more bottom-up, thinking through how that which is absolute might be gestured towards by musical experience. Russell Re Manning makes a case for a natural theology of music, where music points beyond itself to a transcendent (and divine) reality. Here, the transcendent can be understood apart from either any preceding sense of divine revelation or any commitment to an established religious tradition. Through the notion of iconic distance, Re Manning suggests that music opens onto transcendence and sustains its depth, balanced between the tangible and the intangible, revealing the presence of transcendence without worked-out knowledge of it.

Roger Scruton asks whether it is possible to reach beyond to that which transcends the empirical world and, arguing that there are different ways of knowing, suggests that knowledge of the transcendent is not unrealisable. Rather, it is built into human experience, most notably interpersonal encounters, wherein I seek out the 'I' in you. This overreaching, where I am brought to the brink of the empirical world, lies at the core of attentive listening. Here, I am directed towards, and by, the acousmatic space of music and the virtual causality it exhibits, moved by an intentionality that is beyond my own.

Attending to the intertwining of absolute and immanent conceptions of transcendence, Jonas Lundblad elucidates the basis upon which music and religion stand in close proximity in the thought of Friedrich Schleiermacher. For Schleiermacher, both art and religion are mediations of 'feeling' or 'immediacy'. His aesthetically inclined conception of human transcendence attempts to circumvent propositional language's distinction between subject and object and thereby modernity's tendency towards a purposive and objectifying stance in relation to external reality. The medium of music, as Lundblad demonstrates, is paradigmatic within Schleiermacher's vision.

Jeremy Begbie draws 'Music and Absolute Transcendence' to a close and in doing so pushes beyond the points made by the other contributions, situating them theologically. Aware that theological conceptions of transcendence are all too easily dismissed and that philosophical and theological accounts often proceed according to frameworks grounded in a priori notions of human limits, he asks for a closer examination of particular conceptions of transcendence within theological traditions. Such examinations, he suggests, will challenge the idea that transcendence is something that simply stands at the edge of human capacities. They will also question the idea that in relation to music and language one must endorse an either/or approach. Furthermore, such examinations will lead us to consider how music presents a foretaste of what the world is to become, rather than drawing us out of this world into one that lies beyond.

Music and Immanent Transcendence

The section 'Music and Immanent Transcendence' starts with Joshua Waggener's positioning of Rudolf Otto's notion of the 'holy' as the 'non-rational core of religion' in relation to C.P.E. Bach's *Heilig*. Otto suggests that certain sublime pieces of music give articulation to the *mysterium tremendum*. Since Bach's *Heilig* was praised in the eighteenth century as sublime, Waggener uses it to examine to what extent it simulates an encounter with transcendence, using the elements comprising the *mysterium tremendum fascinans et augustum* as the structuring principle of analysis.

In my contribution to the volume, I explore the ways in which transcendence is built into the structure of the music event: music is a border (or liminal) practice that relies upon a process that entails going beyond since it is always 'in between'. Detailing the sensory, processual and relational thresholds that music invokes, I suggest that, in a process analogous to autobiography, music provides a significant means of situating the subject, enabling her to assemble meaning and inhabit both real and virtual (imaginative) places. The last movement of Haydn's String Quartet in E-flat major is used to elucidate this process.

Taking a different tack, one that explores the literal concretion of the musical artist as genius, Diane Silverthorne immerses us in the artistic world of Vienna and in the shift towards veneration of the composer as God. With Beethoven revered there as a genius and his music hailed as sublime, Silverthorne leads us through the philosophical, musical and artistic dynamics that shaped the staging of the 'Klinger: Beethoven Exhibition'. More than this, she guides us through the exhibition itself which, inspired by the principle that all art should aspire to the condition of music, manoeuvres the exhibition visitor ritualistically through passages that lead to and prepare them for an encounter with Klinger's *Beethoven* statue.

Thomas Mulherin re-examines the assumption that E.T.A. Hoffmann's writings advocate absolute music as metaphysical, revealing a realm that transcends this world. Focusing on 'Beethoven's Instrumentalmusik' and *Kreisleriana*, Mulherin maintains that the object of musical revelation is more immanent than absolute, since, through musical form, it represents nature rather than heaven. Such a solution, he suggests, challenges those who would claim that absolute music is devoid of meaning, on the one hand; and disrupts a narrative of aesthetic development that traces a simple historical movement from art as representational to art as expressive, on the other.

Oane Reitsma takes instrumental music as his point of focus, asking on what basis it might be understood as 'religious'. Reitsma argues that musical form instigates 'play' in Gadamerian terms and that it is in this that the performer and listener participate. Within this process, individual horizons fuse with the music encountered, although the music always remains somewhat resistant, unfamiliar and unassimilated. It is on the basis of this dynamic that a particular piece of music can be said to be religious: when musical form fuses in a particular way

with the horizon of an interpreter such that religious ascriptions are assigned, a 'transcendent player' enters the scene.

Christopher Norris explicitly considers how transcendence works on an immanent level. He argues that an adequate ontology of music must account for the fact that musical works transcend themselves in their iteration within different times and contexts. In doing so, Norris presses towards an account of the potential for personal, political and societal transformation that such works permit. Thus, arguing that in order for any kind of ontology of musical works to have explanatory force, limit cases need to be taken account of Norris reflects on political song and reconsiders the notion of the 'classic'. Political song calls into question assumptions that often shadow, if not shape, philosophical ontologies and challenges the idea of classic as that which is timeless, transcendent, ahistorical, apolitical and disinterested. Using the thought of Badiou to provide momentum and taking political song as the litmus test, Norris makes a case for the classic as that which renews its inspirational force over a range of historical, geographical and socio-political situations.

Concluding the section 'Music and Immanent Transcendence', Andrew Bowie prefers not to offer philosophical arguments for the use of transcendence in relation to music, since doing so overlooks the fact that it is because music is non-conceptual that it is philosophically significant. Bowie argues for the importance of understanding music as a sense-making practice. In doing so, he makes a case for understanding transcendence immanently: located within the bounds of human existence, music enables a means of understanding freedom, since it permits moments of liberation and transformation in relation to the constraints of human finitude.

As the contributions to the volume demonstrate, transcendence is integral to every aspect of music: it enables its production, is fundamental to the experience of it and is evident in responses to and reflections upon it. In an important way, music arises from and feeds the human desire to go beyond. It is thus that it acts transformatively and becomes a powerful means of locating oneself within the world and so making sense of it.

